

Guideline for Implementing New Tenured Faculty Review Policies  
November 20, 2017

Approved by the Senate Faculty Review Standards Committee: November 15, 2017

Last year the Academic Senate passed a new tenured faculty review policy. It can be found at: <http://regulations.utah.edu/academics/6-321.php>. The new policy provides that departments and colleges (also referred to as academic “units”) should revise their TFR Statements to reflect the procedures and criteria of the new policy, and such Statements will be finally approved by the Senate Faculty Review Standards Committee and the cognizant senior vice president. Because it will take time for units to adopt new Statements, this guideline is intended to guide units in conducting reviews of their tenured faculty until they have an approved revised Statement.

In particular, this Guideline provides more detail for the new *process* in Policy 6-321. When considering the *substantive* standards to be applied when evaluating a faculty member’s performance, the new Policy provides that one should meet the expectations for a tenured faculty member in their unit. These expectations have historically been articulated in the unit’s existing TFR Statements or in other similar policies of a unit.

As a result, to the extent that there is an inconsistency between a unit’s current TFR Statement and this Guideline, because this Guideline is procedural in nature, it should be followed. If you have questions, please contact the Office for Faculty at 801-581-8763 or [officeforfaculty@utah.edu](mailto:officeforfaculty@utah.edu).

\* \* \*

Tenured Faculty Review Procedures

- I. Notice to participants. To ensure that all review participants are adequately informed of the review scheduling, the department chairperson (dean in single-department colleges) is responsible to provide the following reminders:
  - a) Notice should be given before January 1 to the departmental TFR Committee (see below) and the faculty members to be reviewed, identifying the faculty members due for review each year.
  - b) Notice should be given to the faculty member undergoing a review thirty (30) days before the file closing date (see below) of (1) the file closing date, (2) a list of the information and materials the faculty member will be required to submit for the TFR File, and (3) an invitation to submit any additional information the faculty member desires the departmental TFR Committee to consider.

- c) Notice to the department's tenure-line and career-line faculty members of the scheduled reviews for the year and the opportunity to submit any pertinent comments and information by signed writing to be included in the TFR file by the specified file closing date.
- d) If the reviewed faculty member has a shared-appointment agreement with an interdisciplinary program or with a unit that was an interdisciplinary program (see Policy [6-303-III-C](#), and [Policy 6-001-III-A](#)), notice must be provided to the program administrator at least 30 days in advance of the file closing date requesting that the program submit a report regarding the faculty member's contributions to the TFR Committee at least five business days before the Committee meets.

## II. TFR File.

- a) Information from faculty member engaged in review. A faculty member undergoing a TFR Review shall submit the following items:
  - 1. Curriculum vitae. The faculty member shall submit a current, complete curriculum vitae (CV), organized in a clear and coherent manner, with appropriate dates of various items and logical groupings or categories. If the unit has a standard template, it should be organized using that template.
  - 2. Written report. The faculty member shall provide a written report describing relevant activities and accomplishments for the period of time since the faculty member's most recent formal RPT or TFR Review. The report should describe the faculty member's professional development over time and future professional plans.
  - 3. Other evidence. The faculty member shall provide any other evidence as indicated by the unit's TFR Statement and may provide any other evidence permitted by the unit's TFR Statement.
- b) Information from department chairperson.
  - 1. The department chairperson shall compile and place in the file course evaluation results for the relevant period (developed using the University's approved "Course Feedback Instrument and Report" pursuant to [Policy 6-100-III-N](#)), and those other multiple indicators of

quality of teaching which the unit has adopted as specified within its TFR Statement, consistent with the University's commitment to "assess its courses and instruction in multiple ways" ([Policy 6-100-III-N](#)). Units may elect to include for all TFR Reviews assessments from peer observations and analyses of teaching and teaching materials conducted by peer observers qualified by experience and familiarity with the methods of teaching and subjects appropriate for the discipline.

2. The department chairperson shall add to the file all prior TFR reports, any signed, written information submitted for purposes of the review by any tenure-line or career-line member of the department faculty; any written report submitted by the head of the unit with whom a faculty member's appointment is shared; and other information as specified in the unit's TFR Statement.
  3. The department chairperson is strongly encouraged to provide in writing a summary of the candidate's service contributions as well as any other appropriate information relevant to the faculty member's teaching, research, or clinical contributions that the chairperson is privy to as the administrator of the unit.
- c) Faculty member's rights regarding TFR file. The faculty member is entitled to see all contents of the TFR file upon request at any time during the review process except any external evaluator letters protected by confidentiality. The faculty member may respond to any item in the file by written comment submitted within seven (7) business days after the specified file closing date.
  - d) File closing. The file shall be closed on the date specified in the notices given the faculty member and others by the department chairperson (see above), which shall be at least seven (7) business days before the TFR Committee meets and prepares its report. The file shall be made available to the Committee as of the file closing date.

### III. Department TFR Committee's report.

- a) Committee membership. The departmental TFR Committee membership and leadership are described in the unit's approved TFR Statement. The Committee's members must all be tenured and have the same or higher rank as the reviewed faculty member. It must have at least two members (for small departments, a special exception for membership may be approved in advance

by the cognizant senior vice president). It may consist of as many as all of the unit's tenured and rank-qualified members (except the reviewed faculty member). The department chairperson and all ranks of deans and vice presidents and the President are not eligible to serve on the Committee.

- b) TFR Committee report. After reviewing the file, the TFR Committee or, for those units that so choose, a smaller subcommittee of the TFR Committee shall prepare a report that reflects the faculty member's performance in the areas of teaching, research, service, and as appropriate, clinical work; the report should not be based on any single area. For a shared-appointment, the TFR Committee report shall reflect discussion and consideration of any report submitted by the interdisciplinary academic program.

The Committee's report shall include a faculty member's accomplishments and opportunities for further improvement. It must include the committee's overall *findings and recommendations* and, include a specific statement of whether the faculty member has made meaningful and sustained contributions in their role such that they are meeting the standards for a tenured faculty member in the unit (typically described in the unit's current TFR Statement). When appropriate, the report should include commendations and/or strategies, timelines (including those for follow-up reviews), and recommendations for improvement of a faculty member's performance.

Unless otherwise specifically provided in the unit's TFR Statement, the Committee may choose to consult with the faculty member while preparing a final version of the report to ensure accuracy of included information or discuss any contemplated recommendations.

- c) Confidentiality. All TFR Committee deliberations are personnel actions and should be treated with confidentiality in accordance with policy and law.
- d) Distribution to TFR Committee members. The Committee report must be shared with all TFR Committee members, and then, if needed, revised based on their review and feedback. The report, with any such revisions made, will become the Committee's final report when approved by vote of a majority of the Committee members. The department chairperson and all ranks of deans and vice presidents and the President are not eligible to participate in this review and vote for the report.
- e) Candidate receipt and opportunity to respond. The Committee's report then shall be sent to the reviewed faculty member as well as the department chair,

dean, and cognizant senior vice president. The reviewed faculty member has the opportunity to respond to the Committee's report within seven (7) calendar days of receiving it, by submitting a written response to the designated leadership of the Committee. The Committee's report, and any written response of the reviewed faculty member, will be included in the TFR file .

IV. Finalizing a TFR Report.

- a) The departmental TFR Committee's report will serve as the Final TFR Report if no party seeks review of the report.
- b) As provided in Policy 6-321, the reviewed faculty member, the department chairperson, or the dean, who disagrees with the TFR Committee's report, may seek review by the University Promotion and Tenure Advisory Committee ("UPTAC") following the procedures outlined in Policy 6-304. A party who chooses to seek review must notify UPTAC of that intention within twenty-one (21) calendar days of the distribution of the departmental Committee's report.
- c) After reviewing the entire file, UPTAC will either (1) uphold the departmental Committee's report without change, or (2) describe particular errors in the report's findings or recommendations which the departmental Committee will then correct accordingly. Once found satisfactory by UPTAC, the departmental Committee report will constitute the Final TFR report for the TFR process under Policy 6-321.

V. Action After a Final TFR Report.

- a) If the faculty member is found to be meeting the standards for a tenured faculty member in the unit, the cognizant senior vice president will formally acknowledge the evaluation and will consult with the dean and department chairperson to designate an appropriate recognition for the achievement.
- b) If the faculty member is found not to be meeting the minimum standards required of a tenured faculty member in the unit, the dean and department chairperson, together with designated members of the review committee and other faculty members as needed, shall work with the reviewed faculty member to implement the recommendations of the Final TFR Report.

VI. Relationship to Other Processes.

In the course of any review of a tenured faculty member, if an issue arises under the Code of Faculty Rights and Responsibilities ([Policy 6-316](#)), such as an issue that is appropriate for consideration by the University's Office of Equal Opportunity and Affirmative Action ([Policy 1-012](#)), the Senate Committee on Academic Freedom and Faculty Rights ([Policy 6-010](#)), or the Senate Consolidated Hearing Committee ([Policy 6-011](#)), that issue should proceed as is appropriate under the relevant Policy. If a case is referred to or a complaint filed with one of these bodies, those entities may request that the tenured faculty review process be suspended until the matter is resolved.